

# INDEPENDENT EVALUATION

of the MADHYA PRADESH
MAJOR DISTRICT ROADS PROJECT
(MPMDRP)

New Delhi, 9 December 2022



## **BACKGROUND**

- ➤ First project evaluation completed by IEO
- ➤ Evaluation conducted within the framework of NDB Evaluation Policy
- ➤ Evaluation discussed by NDB Board of Directors next week
- ➤ Final evaluation report and key outputs will be publicly disclosed

## **COUNTRY AND PROJECT CONTEXT**

India is a founding member of the NDB with 20% shareholding

NDB has financed **22** projects in India with funding of

**US\$ 7.49** billion

Largest portfolio in transport sector

Project implemented in **24** districts of Madhya Pradesh



## PROJECT DESIGN

#### **OBJECTIVES**

To improve connectivity of the rural interior with the national and state highway networks, to boost economic activity in rural hinterland

#### **COMPONENTS**

One main component: Civil works and equipment

#### **IMPLEMENTING ARRANGEMENTS**

**Government of Madhya Pradesh** main executing agency.

Madhya Pradesh Roads

Development Corporation

designed project

implementing agency

#### **FINANCING**

Total project costs **US\$ 500 million**: US\$ 350 sovereign loan by NDB and US\$ 150 million GOMP counterpart contribution

#### **IMPLEMENTATION PERIOD**

Approved in November **2016**, closed in March **2022** (with one year extension)

# **EVALUATION OBJECTIVES, METHODOLOGY AND PROCESS**

#### **Objective:**

➤ to assess and document results and generate lessons and recommendations for the future

#### Methodology:

- Use of internationally recognized evaluation criteria with ratings with mix methods and triangulation techniques
- Collection and analysis of primary and secondary qualitative and quantitative data

### **FOUR MAIN PHASES:**

preparatory
phase with desk
reviews

field mission

analysis, report writing and stakeholders workshop

communication and dissemination

## MAIN FINDINGS: AREAS OF STRENGTH



MPMDRP objectives well aligned with Government policies and NDB General Strategies



Project achieved or surpassed key design targets (e.g., Kms of roads)



Good effectiveness and evidence of emerging impacts (e.g., in terms of improved incomes, etc)



Sustainability prospects are encouraging, also due to private sector engagement in maintenance



Environmental & social safeguards followed and financial management satisfactory



Strong performance of Government and the PIU

## MAIN FINDINGS: AREAS IN NEED OF ATTENTION



Project not adequately contextualized within wider transport strategy of the State



Insufficient analytic work at design, which was also not guided by a country strategy



Choice of concrete over bitumen for roads not explicitly analyzed



Knowledge management, innovation and M&E did not receive adequate attention and resources



Insufficient project supervision and implementation support, and frequent changes in NDB lead office. No MTR conducted



Project efficiency was the weakest area of performance

## **KEY CONCLUSIONS**

Overall, the project achieved satisfactory results

Improved connectivity
has contributed to
enhanced economic
and social activities

The relevant experience of the executing agency and PIU were determining factors for project success



The private sector has played a useful part in implementation and maintenance

Quality of design and supervision and implementation support were insufficient



Project efficiency was the weakest performing area

## RECOMMENDATIONS.

# **New Development Bank**



Develop a country strategy to guide the NDB-India partnership and programming for the future



Invest in strengthening technical quality of design and tighten design quality assurance processes



Conduct
more robust
supervision and
implementation
support,
closely monitor
follow-up to
supervision
recommendations,
and regularly
conduct MTRs



Pay more attention to knowledge management and policy engagement also as a means for scaling up impact



Further examine and clearly articulate the important role of the India regional office

## RECOMMENDATIONS.

# **Government of Madhya Pradesh**



